

**TaxMasters Official Site**  Visit today for a Free Consultation [Visit Now](#)

Txmstr.com Ads by Google

**ScrippsNews** [columnists](#) [investigative projects](#) [videos](#) [latest blogs](#) [contact us](#)  
[about us](#) [login/register](#)

[News](#) | [Washington](#) | [Sports](#) | [Entertainment](#) | [Lifestyle](#) | [Business & Technology](#) | [Opinion and Editorials](#)

Google   [Web](#)

ScrippsNews

Home » By DEROY MURDOCK, Scripps Howard News Service

## Murdock: Obamacare vs. U.S. Constitution

Submitted by SHNS on Thu, 02/11/2010 - 17:25  
By DEROY MURDOCK, Scripps Howard News Service [editorials and opinion](#)  
[ShareThis](#) [Public support for ObamaCare legislation is dismal.](#)

According to a recent Fox News/Opinion Dynamics poll, among 900 registered voters surveyed, only 23 percent want it enacted. Fully 70 percent disagree. Among them, 47 percent would start over, and 23 percent would do nothing.

Nonetheless, ObamaCare is like a quietly rumbling volcano -- dormant, but not yet dead. President Obama and his Democratic colleagues oscillate between tears over their stalled pet project and cheers that "We're moving forward," as Obama recently chirped. The White House's February 25 bipartisan healthcare summit is a sulfurous puff of smoke that should worry ObamaCare opponents.

Consequently, those who want to stop this ruinous measure should keep highlighting its shortcomings until this initiative is extinct.

Consider, then, that ObamaCare flunks the first test of any potential federal law: It is not constitutional. ObamaCare critics deem the individual mandate unconstitutional, since Congress lacks the power to force Americans to buy anything, especially health insurance they wisely or foolishly may not want.

Congress' legitimate power to regulate interstate commerce has been stretched like saltwater taffy. "It is one thing, however, for Congress to regulate economic activity in which individuals choose to engage; it is another to require that individuals engage in such activity," Senator Orrin Hatch, R, Utah, former Ohio Secretary of State J. Kenneth Blackwell, and the American Civil Rights Union's Kenneth Klukowski observed in the January 2 Wall Street Journal. "That is not a difference in degree, but instead a difference in kind."

Beyond this lies another problem. The individual mandate would be enforced by penalizing Americans \$495 or 0.5 percent of Adjusted Gross Income, whichever is higher, if they do not acquire health insurance by 2014. That fine would rise to 2 percent of AGI, equal to \$640 today, just two years later. Anticipated fines total some \$15 billion.

The IRS would collect these payments and require Americans to certify on their tax returns that they carry health coverage. This represents a "direct" tax on U.S. citizens, based solely on the status of living in America. This is not a tax on income. It is not an excise tax either, since there is no tax on any transaction; if one refuses to purchase insurance, there is no transaction on which to slap an excise tax.

As Senator John Ensign, R, Nevada, told his colleagues on the Senate floor: "Anything we have ever done, somebody actually had to have an action before we could tax or regulate it."

"Without precedent, Congress is attempting to punish the non-purchase of a private product," says Robert Levy, senior fellow for constitutional studies at the Cato Institute, which he chairs. "That would be an intolerable affront to the Constitution and personal autonomy."

Nonetheless, the individual mandate's IRS enforcement scheme operates, in essence, as a tax. The hitch is that Article I, Section 8 of the U.S. Constitution states: "The Congress shall have Power To lay and collect Taxes, Duties, Imposts and Excises." Section 9 adds that "No Capitation, or other direct, Tax shall be laid, unless in Proportion to the Census or Enumeration herein before directed to be taken."



### Wild hogs

America's wild hog is exploding and spreading country, more than size and range in the Two decades ago, some between 500,000 and pigs roamed the United 17 states. Now the numbers between 2 million in 44 states. Aided by hunters, the pigs spreading

How to stop the pigs

Wild pigs found in counting

Location of wild hog

Editorial: The wild - and they're hungry

### Quick lab

As Americans struggle charge of their head hold down their me growing number are doctor and going right source for diagnosis Consumers get their results straight from Consumers have m getting medical tests Editorial: Bypassing going direct to the

### Forgive your debts

More Americans are that debt collectors shady and possibly to hound them for Scripps Howard investigations found. Complaints from federal authorities unscrupulous debt on pace to be more higher than two years. Complaints rising on practices by debt collectors

### Dead Wro



- Latest Stories**
- Withers: Don't expand the NCAA tournament**  
By BUD WITHERS, The Seattle Times
  - Accused Tenn. school shooter was admonished week before**  
By LOLA ALAPO and DON JACOBS, Scripps Howard News Service
  - War dog monument comes closer to creation**  
By ERICH HINER, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Autos: Volkswagen on track for growth in Chattanooga**  
By RICHARD WILLIAMSON, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Editorial: Presidents Day and how it grew**  
An editorial / By Dale McFeatters, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Editorial: Why Valentine's Day?**  
An editorial / By Dale McFeatters, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Players will see different Pebble Beach at U.S. Open**  
By RON KROI CHICK, San Francisco Chronicle
  - Kia Sorento specs**  
Scripps Howard News Service
  - DriveWays: Kia Sorento CUV nothing like old Sorento**  
FRANK A. AUKOFER, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Watch: Can we fix our government?**  
By ANN MCFEATTERS, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Morrow-TV: Winter Olympics the main event next week**  
By TERRY MORROW, Scripps Howard News Service
  - RedBlueAmerica: Is bipartisanship a virtue?**  
By BEN BOYCHUK and JOEL MATHIS, Scripps Howard News Service
  - California wineries go green**  
By JEFF HORSEMAN, The Press-Enterprise
  - McNulty: NOW attack on Teflon ad lurches into absurdity**  
By RAY MCNULTY, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Ambrose: The coming Social Security crisis**  
By JAY AMBROSE, Scripps Howard News Service
  - Five Americans to watch at Winter Olympics**

### Obese woman wins human-rights fight for parking spot

By INGRID PERITZ, Toronto Globe and Mail

## Murdock: Obamacare vs. U.S. Constitu...

If ObamaCare somehow re-erupts into active status, it likely would rely on this ultimately toothless individual suggestion, which many Americans gladly would ignore. Without Washington's capacity to pressure Americans into submission, the number of participants in ObamaCare likely would fall well below projections, and this entire, glorious experiment would implode.

One of the most compelling arguments against ObamaCare is that it is self-defeating and unconstitutional. That is yet another reason why this menacing monster must be silenced.

(Deroy Murdock is a columnist with Scripps Howard News Service and a media fellow with the Hoover Institution on War, Revolution and Peace at Stanford University. E-mail him at [deroy.Murdock\(at\)gmail.com](mailto:deroy.Murdock(at)gmail.com))

COLUMN

#### Comment viewing options

Threaded list - expanded | Date - oldest first | 30 comments per page | Save settings

Select your preferred way to display the comments and click "Save settings" to activate your changes.

#### HEALTH INSURANCE

Submitted by KarinNowla (not verified) on Fri, 02/12/2010 - 02:54.

Get medical insurance for your entire family at the best price from <http://bit.ly/atGzeD>

>  
reply

#### Comment viewing options

Threaded list - expanded | Date - oldest first | 30 comments per page | Save settings

Select your preferred way to display the comments and click "Save settings" to activate your changes.

#### Post new comment

Your name:

Anonymous

E-mail:

The content of this field is kept private and will not be shown publicly.

Homepage:

Subject:

Comment: \*

[Large empty text area for comment]

- Allowed HTML tags: <em> <strong> <cite> <code> <ul> <ol> <li> <dl> <dt> <dd>
- Lines and paragraphs break automatically.

#### More information about formatting options

##### CAPTCHA

This question is for testing whether you are a human visitor and to prevent automated spam submissions.

Math question: \*

\* five = fifteen

Solve this math question and enter the solution with digits. E.g. for "two plus four = ?" enter "6".

Americans. A first-c  
also found that you  
educated and weal  
more likely to be a  
they die. More mer  
are autopsied. And  
Hispanics, Asians ar  
Americans are more  
autopsied than whi  
Autopsy rates diffe  
sex, education

#### Editorial: A federal

- 4 comments
- U.S. rated 'mostly f
- to other nations
- 4 comments
- Tea Party moveme
- post-World War II r
- 4 comments
- Calif. seniors fear t
- could endanger car
- 3 comments
- Residue from cigar
- may pose health ha
- says
- 3 comments
- Debtadviser: Forec
- on your credit rep
- 3 comments
- Las Vegas strip clu
- customers practice
- 2 comments
- Dessert: The view
- snowbank
- 2 comments
- Tramel: Sabathia t
- Yankees
- 2 comments
- RedBlueAmerica: Is
- a virtue?
- 2 comments

#### Tax Relief for IRS Debt

Experienced Tax Relief Attorneys. Reduce taxes and be tax debt free. [FreedomTaxRelief.com](http://FreedomTaxRelief.com)

#### IRS Tax Relief

Cut Payments & IRS Debts Fast. Free & Fast to Apply Online. [FreedomFinancialNetw](http://FreedomFinancialNetw)

#### IRS Problems? Levy? Lien?

End Your IRS Nightmare Now. Learn Your Options. Please Read This Now [ustaxsolutionsinc.com](http://ustaxsolutionsinc.com)

#### Settle IRS Tax Debt

Discuss Your Tax Options & Levies Contact Your Tax Consultant Today [www.TaxReliefSource.c](http://www.TaxReliefSource.c)

---

Navigation

- [recent posts](#)

---

User login

Username

Password

---

CAPTCH

This question is:  
whether you a  
visitor and to  
automated spam

Math ques

$14 + 2 = \square$

Solve this simple ma  
enter the result. E.g.  
4.

- [Create new user](#)
- [Request new user](#)



Scripps Newspaper Group — Online  
© 2009 The E.W. Scripps Co.  
[Privacy Policy](#) | [User Agreement](#)

---

Opinions expressed in user comments are not endorsed by ScrippsNews.